Food and Nutrition Security — meanings and appropriations from the civil society segment of the National Council for Food and Nutrition Security

Significados e Apropriações da Noção de Segurança Alimentar e Nutricional pelo Segmento da Sociedade Civil do Conselho Nacional de Segurança Alimentar e Nutricional

Resumo

Diante do quadro de grandes transformações das duas últimas décadas e suas repercussões nos padrões de produção e consumo de alimentos, fortalece-se no Brasil a temática da Segurança Alimentar e Nutricional (SAN), fazendo referência às questões alimentares que dizem respeito ao conjunto da população, e não apenas aos segmentos mais vulneráveis. A importância da sociedade civil tem sido evidenciada pela realização de significativas experiências de SAN em seu próprio campo, como também em parceria com o governo para a formulação de propostas e ações, e em seu monitoramento e controle. Como resultado da pesquisa de identificação dos diferentes significados da incorporação do enfoque de segurança alimentar e nutricional, por parte dos movimentos e organizações da sociedade civil participantes do Conselho de Segurança Alimentar e Nutricional Nacional na gestão 2004-2007, verificou-se a apropriação da temática nas seguintes direções: favorecimento da interação entre campos temáticos das esferas da produção e do consumo; impulso à visão da alimentação como um direito humano; objetivo ético do desenvolvimento; aquisição de perspectiva intra e intersetorial; e necessidade de um processo educativo de caráter dialógico e emancipatório.

Palavras-Chave: Segurança alimentar e nutricional; Educação alimentar e nutricional; Participação social;
Abstract

The huge transformations that occurred in the last two decades had impacts on the standards of food production and consumption, and determined a wider discussion in Brazil about the theme of food and nutrition security. It has also expanded the scope of it, which now considers nourishing aspects regarding the entire population and not only its most vulnerable segments. This research identified different meanings present in the speech about food and nutrition security, terms incorporated by movements and civil society organizations that were represented at the National Council for Food and Nutrition Security (administration 2004-2007). Thematic appropriation could be observed in the following directions: a) privileging the interaction between thematic fields from both production and consumption spheres; b) strengthening the idea of nutrition as a human right; c) including an ethical goal to the country’s development; d) development of an intra and intersectorial perspective; e) identifying the need of dialogic and freeing educational processes.

Keywords: Food and Nutrition Security; Nutritional Education; Social Participation.

Introduction

Food and nutrition security, a concept still new in Brazil, deals with the cultural, social and environmental dimensions related to foods and nourishment.

What one eats and how one eats in each society is not defined solely by individual choices, but is the expression of simultaneous interaction of a set of elements, among which can be found production and distribution systems, and also the knowledge about possible forms of food preparation and consumption; these, in their turn, are dependant of eating habits of one’s society, of laws that govern the labor market, of family relationships, of international markets, of the estate action towards granting people’s rights to have access to food, etc. (Siliprandi, 2004).

Brazilian definition of Food and Nutrition Security (FNS) was defined by Brazilian Forum of Food and Nutrition Security (BFFNS) and approved at the II National Conference of Food and Nutrition Security (2004); after that, it was incorporated to the Nutrition Security Act (NSA), published in September 15th, 2006. The references to the entire population, instead of concentrating only on the vulnerable ones, are shown by the inclusion of the nutritional dimension, the availability and safety of food:

Food and Nutrition Security (FNS) is the implementation of everybody’s right to have regular and continuous access to quality, sufficient food, without compromising the access to other essential needs. It is based on feeding habits in accordance with health promotion, on the respect for cultural diversity, and on social, economical and environmental sustainability. (National Council for Food and Nutrition Security - NCFNS, 2004)

Beyond hunger and malnutrition, food insecurity is intimately related to obesity, overweight, inadequate nutrition related diseases and to poor food quality. Food pricing regulation policies, waste combat and production models that exclude poor people and degrade the environment are also part of this field.

In 2006, the Nutrition Security Act (NSA) was approved by Brazilian president, declaring access to
food an estate policy. The Act created the National System of Food and Nutrition Security (NSFNS), whose mission is to formulate and implement FNS policies and plans, stimulating the integration of efforts among the government and civil society; at the same time, it tries and promote the follow up, monitoring and assessment of the country’s FNS. Through the act, an Interministerial Chamber was created, in order to organize and articulate all the ministries and special agencies that are involved with the theme. Finally, the NCFNS became a permanent Council.

The importance of civil society’s participation must be highlighted in the implementation of a large variety of experiences, and also in partnership with the government for proposing, monitoring and assessing different actions. This was the motto with which the NCFNS led a national campaign for the approval of nutrition as a constitutional right, which was attained in February 2010 through a Constitutional Amendment. In the same year, another governmental decree regulated the NSA, establishing the guidelines for the National Plan for Food and Nutrition Security (NPFNS) and its assessment and monitoring systems. According to the decree, the guidelines should be:

I – to promote universal access to adequate and healthy food, with priority given to families and people who are in a state of food and nutritional insecurity;

II – to promote the supply and organization of food production, processing and distribution systems which are sustainable, decentralized and ecological;

III – the foundation of permanent processes to support food and nutritional education, research and professional training in this field and human rights to proper food;

IV – to promote universal and coordinated actions towards food and nutritional security of quilombo-las\(^3\) and other traditional communities (classified according to Federal Decree 6,040, 2007), Indian populations and agrarian reform settlers;

V – to strengthen food and nutrition actions in all levels of health care, in coordination with other such actions;

VI – to promote universal access to good quality, sufficient water (with priority given to families and people who are in a state of water insecurity) and to the production of familiar agriculture, fishery and aquaculture;

VII – to support initiatives to promote food sovereignty, food and nutrition security and human right to adequate nutrition at an international sphere, and also international negotiations based in the principles and guidelines of the NSA;

VIII – monitoring the implementation of adequate nutrition as a human right.

Since FNS’s legal framework is the result of a joint effort of civil society and government, the incorporation of its point of view in the main governmental reference documents asks for a counterpoint, in order to understand in depth the significations attributed to this notion and its meanings within civil society. Therefore, this research presents the results of an investigation of FNS meanings for civil society members of the NCFNS in the period of 2004-2007, which are relevant due to their weight in the establishment of Brazilian FNS’s agenda.

**National Council for Food and Nutrition Security (NCFNS)**

In order to identify and analyze different meanings of FNS point of view, it has been investigated civil society’s learning through the experience of taking part at NCFNS. In particular, we looked into what were the integrative approach repercussions on civil society’s field, on its entities, their conceptions and the way they relate to society.

NCFNS’s experience is relatively recent compared to other councils. Its composition reflects a wide social network: in the period we studied (2002-2007), 59 councilors were appointed, 17 of which were State ministers and 42 were members of organized civil society; 17 observers were also invited. Its presidency was occupied by Francisco Menezes, researcher of the Instituto Brasileiro de Análises Sociais e Econômicas (Brazilian Institute for Social and Economical Analysis); a state minister, Patrus Ananias (Ministry of Social Development and Combat to Hunger), was appointed secretary. Many different organizations

---

\(^3\) Quilombola is a community of slave descendants.
were engaged in the council, representing the wide variety of interfaces involved with the nutrition theme - production, health, industry, consumers, and commerce, and also non-governmental organizations, religious and ethnical entities and estate and municipal councils.

Methodology

Due to the fact that this theme is still little present in scientific literature, this research had a character of initial investigation, describing a particular reality and searching to extract from it contents that could contribute to further development. It can thus be classified as an exploratory research, as defined by Gil (1994): social research is a process that, using scientific methodology, allows the achievement of new knowledge in the field of social reality.

In the exploratory phase, a revision of literature was made, and a number of articles and documents retrieved discussing different aspects involved at the nutritional issues’ interfaces, the main historical landmarks and, finally, civil society’s participation.

Next step was to verify how FNS is being treated in the food and nutritional field, through the investigation of public health reference documents. After that, a semi-structured questionnaire was used to characterize civil society’s councilors at the NCFNS, regarding personal and represented organization identification, NCFNS participation and type of work of their organizations.

Organizations were classified, according to their nature, in Employer’s Associations (2), Universities and Research Institutes (6), Religious Organizations (5), Unions (3), Special Populations Organizations (2), Estate councils for FNS (3), Non-governmental entities and networks (13). In order to get a clearer understanding of different points of view, 18 in-depth interviews were made in the period of April to July 2007, following contacts with each one of the segments.

The planning of the itinerary for the interviews took as starting point the identified meanings of FNS found at the reference documents of Nutrition and Food’s field. In them, FNS was described as:

- The expression of an ampler vision of the nutritional circuit, which gives visibility to the interactions between thematic fields of the spheres of production and consumption;
- A strategic objective of nation’s development and the consequent achievement of healthy physical and social environments;
- A human right;
- A point of view that favors intra and intersectorial dialogue;
- An educational process based on dialogical, freeing methodology.

After a “floating reading” of the data obtained through the interviews, as proposed by Minayo (2006), we reached the corpus of the text. Collected data were decomposed into smaller theme units, defined according to the identified categories of the subjects’ speech; these units were grouped in six sets (with subsets) and discussed according to theoretical references.

Our sight was guided by two orders of references: the meanings found on the official documents and by the approach of complexity (Morin, 2003; Almeida Filho, 2005; Capra, 1982).

Results and Discussion

Synthetically, the underlying meanings of FNS present into civil society representatives’ speech can be presented as in Figure 1.

The interviews suggest that, for the social leaders, to participate of the NCFNS is a learning experience that is transmitted to their organizations. That’s why we want to clarify its paths, confronting them to the vocation and trajectory of organizations and social movements.

We used a systems approach as analytical tool to identify interdependency relationships amongst the factors that are involved in the nutritional issue. This was meant to allow a clearer, more dynamic picture of social processes involved in the circuits where nutrition circulates, including food production, distribution and commerce, consumption, quality and health spheres.

In the general picture, interviewees mentioned 2003 as the year that marked the beginning of a period: that’s when the government and society boosted the articulation of a national policy for
FNS. They highlighted the beneficial effects of the NSA and the NSFNS, pointing out at the same time that in itself did not guarantee efficacy: social participation through the NCFNS and the many experiences of civil society entities had to be a constitutive part of a national policy. They highlighted as well the challenge that Brazilian society has to face - its capacity of keeping up mobilization. Only the organized society can create dynamic spaces for popular interference in the process of setting guidelines and proposals, follow ups and monitoring of national and local programs and projects for improving food and nutritional conditions.

**FNS Meanings – “thematic fields’ rapprochement”**

In the category of production and consumption thematic fields’ rapprochement, it could be verified that this is an incipient process, partly because it is a wide theme with unclear borders.

Nutrition and health related organizations expressed their worries and concerns about food production, showing that food consumption and production dimensions are no longer dissociated: a more integrated view of nutritional issues is becoming commoner in Brazilian society. Consumers are giving more importance to food origins, to the relationship between nutrition and health and to environment protection, and inquiring about production systems; there’s a growing share of market that looks for family-based, eco-friendly production goods. On the industry side, it was seen that consumers’ changing habits had effects on food producers: they are more concerned with quality and the choice of products to be grown, and acting upon health and nutritional education.

In the field of health, particularly, which is usually marked by the biomedical model, the discussion about FNS is done considering all the levels of attention to health: promotion, protection and recovery. Of course, to speak of healthy nutrition remits us to the consideration of social, environmental and cultural dimensions of food, and reinforces the need of articulating different fields of knowledge and action.

**FNS Meanings – “Human right to adequate and healthy nutrition”**

The interviewees cited a whole set of meanings that relate this right to other human rights, such as right to revenue, land and water. This was mostly addressed by union representatives. On the whole, the wel-
fare approach supported by the religious segment seems to have been overcome, whilst there is an increase in knowledge about government’s duties in the nutritional field and in politicization of hunger combat - themes highlighted by non-governmental organizations and universities.

The strengthening of the notion of right and the expansion of this issue’s scope beyond hunger gave rise to different orders of questions, identified at the speeches of union members: they described nutritional insecurity of various categories of workers, rural as well as urban, due to precarious working conditions. They also pointed out that nutritional insecurity is related to conflicts with governmental sectors favorable to an export centered, monoculture agricultural model, and to insufficient revenue limiting the possibilities of a healthy nutrition.

For the social movements, the notion of human right to food comes up offering new meanings to old fights, such as agrarian reform. However, another relevant liaison emerges in the interview of a Semi-Arid Association (SAA4): “Who are the beneficiaries of this division? The ones who produce food! Therefore this is an important nuance! They’re the ones who will not only produce wealth, but produce and distribute food [...].”

The right to gender, ethnic, racial and cultural diversity emerges as a relevant issue in this group of meanings; it unfolds into the recognition of specific meanings of inequality and the need for researches and specific methods for investigating them. This is necessary to the planning of public policies where they can be taken in.

All the interviewed groups mentioned the consequences of FNS introduction as a human right in the public programs. In the sphere of a national public policy for FNS, some programs are considered fundamental (Maluf, 2007) due to their capacity of articulation of public action around key issues; examples of those are the Family Grant Program, the National Program to Support Family Agriculture, National School Feeding Program, Food Purchase Program, Nutrition Surveillance System. Their national structure and interrelations with other actions allow them to outbound their specific objectives and function as nucleators of integrated activities.

It could be seen that civil society is undertaking new forms of interaction with public programs, in particular between food institutional market and family agriculture.

The School Feeding Program was highlighted as a FNS program, as it feeds 36 million students. Besides, it is seen by the interviewees as a potential field for healthy food promotion and stimulus to regional social development through local cookery and family agriculture. More recently, another program - Food Purchase Program - also contributed to integrating town and country: it stimulates family agriculture production as supplier of public equipments. In addition to what has been cited before, other themes fight for space in the agenda, such as environmental agriculture.

Government actions towards feeding and food are sprawled among different organs of the estate apparatus, and interviewees felt that this seemed to put forward the risk of sectorization by the public administration. This would determine a biased, partial treatment of the question.

This question refers to what has already been discussed regarding the emergency, in the 1990’s, of new policies for FNS which had an intersectorial character. Under this approach, supra-sectorial character of public policies would imply in the appropriation, by involved sectors, of ampler objectives of FNS, due to a deeper, integrated understanding of its components. These are related to food - availability, production, commerce and access - and to nutrition (feeding practices and biological use of foods) (Burlandy, 2004).

Finally, when we look into the possible connections between FNS and Health Promotion, it comes up that the first is close to what is being called “new health promotion”, which is critic to the preventive, medical approach of health; it intends to act upon health determinants, in order to create social and physical environments favorable to health (Oliveira, 2005). The intersection of adequate, healthy food

---

4 Semi-Arid Association is a network congregating 750 civil society organizations that work in management and policy making for dealing with semi-arid region in Brazilian’s north-east region.
and its production, supply and distribution is a ground where this dialogue can happen (Pinheiro, 2005). Therefore, FNS, seen from the point of view of health promotion, is a strategy for intersectorial public policies.

Morin (2003) highlights the importance of an education towards developing a culture that helps people to distinguish, contextualize and globalize multidimensional, global and fundamental problems. Such an education would make people more conscious of the challenges related to the increasing complexity of problems faced by human knowledge.

A systemic, interdisciplinary approach to healthy nutrition can not only recover different dimensions of nutrition. It can also historically contextualize food production, in a critical analysis of today's lack of sustainability of production and consumption patterns. This is to say that to include FNS's point of view into the guidelines of Health Promotion means to increase its contents and also to widen the knowledge about nutrition system contradictions. This is the reason why, according to the interviewees, history, sociology, anthropology, agronomy and ecology have to be called in.

The linkage of FNS systemic approaches and Health Promotion could also be made through its discussion in conjunction with the positive strategies proposed at the Ottawa Letter (1986): building healthy public policies; creating supportive environments; strengthening community actions; developing personal skills and reorienting health services. Since the capacity of stimulating community action is part of improving local environmental sustainability, the NSFNS's implantation can use Health Promotion's accumulated experience towards linking individual, familiar and community experiences to wider processes.

A last set of meanings reunites references to difficulties in FNS promotion which have become more visible when the nutritional theme became central: conflicts, tensions and bottlenecks in the implementation of FNS that require, many times, professional training and update of services or legislation. In particular, small producer's difficulties in taking part of public biddings, traditional approach of technical support and gender iniquities were highlighted.

**FNS Meanings – “Strategic Objective for Development”**

Given the centrality achieved by the right to nutrition in Brazilian's public life, the possibility of composition with other rights was raised by some interviewees, in special those from nongovernmental organizations. The need of a government and society articulated policy towards a strategic project of development was raised, a project able to conjugate economic factors with social equity, environment sustainability and cultural appreciation.

**FNS Meanings – “Intersectorial Articulation”**

FNS was mentioned by the interviewees as a mobilizing strategy that could articulate actions of different social actors. First of all, regarding the articulation of subjects, intersectorial action articulation depends on the context of social organizations, their degree of cohesion, their experience of dialogue and negotiation between themselves and with the government instances. Participants highlighted the difficulties caused by the great fragmentation which is characteristic of government structures' organization; this actually is the counterpoint to the fragmentation present also in civil society organizations, which expresses itself in separate fights and lack of articulation between actors and organizations.

It seems to us that complex problems such as the ones related to FNS ask for ampler national agreements, as defended by Westphal (1999) and Burlandy et al (2006). Westphal defends the importance of society’s learning to propose joint, intersectorial projects and, therefore, to build up the process of new “institutional insertion”, whilst Burlandy et al analyses civil society using a systemic approach. To succeed in making agreements does not mean to eliminate all the conflicts between involved actors; it means to create the ways for submitting the interests at stake’s logic to an integrated system, able to adjust to different visions.
FNS Meanings – “Educational Process”

During the interviews, at the same time that people expressed the proposition of guidelines, assessments and monitoring models for FNS actions, it was highlighted how the participation in the NCFNS worked as training for the councilors. Even though the effects of it on the organizations that take part of the council cannot be verified, this is a point we would like to discuss, trying to qualify, from the educational point of view, facts and needs. It was possible to identify a need for training in order to deepen FNS knowledge and appropriation in two fronts, one internal and the other external to the council, so that public actions become more consistent.

Interviewees considered training as a prerequisite for FNS’s system implantation. It has to be carefully considered as it is usually translated as nutritional education retraining. Some of our respondents established distinctions between nutritional education and FNS education, which would have a wider scope.

Even in the field of nutrition, some interviewees highlighted the importance of stimulating anthropological researches so that the relationship of nutrition, its origins, composition and symbolic values is related to local culture.

It is worth remembering that Boog (2005), analyzing scientific production in the last 30 years, identified at least two tendencies for nutritional education, one of positivist “esprit”, the other of anthropological perspective. He alerts us to the importance of having health and nutrition professionals looking into feeding culture, its symbols, values and role if they want to interfere in the process of feeding habits’ change. In this perspective, Boog defends that nutritional education must not be based only in the science of nutrition:

“The more contextualized is the approach, the better conditions there will be for developing educational actions in a wider perspective, not focused only in information but prioritizing the re-creation of meanings to the act of feeding, inserted in an ampler determination context” (Boog, 2005).

Treating the difficulties of education in the field of nutrition, the author highlights the challenges of facing complexity and multidimensionality; of moving from biological to social, from individual to collective, from affective to rational, from cultural to economic approaches in order to contribute to social equity and quality of life. In the same sense, Morin alerts us to the need of an education that allows to the new generations an overview, so as to see objects in their context,

“[…] searching to replace the supremacy of fragmented knowledge that privileges only what is measurable, towards a comprehensive, polysemic understanding of objects which does not ignore or excludes from them the rites or the mental structures that bear their symbolic existence. And feeding is a complex object at its most” (Morin, 2000).

In tune with a complex approach to feeding, Azevedo (2004) puts in counterpoint the idea of a healthy diet to the notion of nutritional models – understood as people’s particular feeding and nutrition characteristics. He also discusses the concept of a healthy life, not related only to nutrition but to a certain way of living which is culturally referenced. This author points out that, historically, models have adjusted to changes whilst respecting people’s culture, but modernity’s industrialized culture, based in standardization and strongly influenced by an urban lifestyle, is characterized by the rupture of traditions and mobility. Therefore, it does not take nutritional habits’ territoriality into consideration; the predominance of its economical and technological logic has repercussions over population’s health in the cities as in rural areas.

The reading of the interviews showed us that, as it deals with subjects that are related to the universe of intimacy, an educational approach in the FNS perspective should shift its emphasis from a dietary point of view to one which a) considers economical, political, environmental, cultural and anthropological visions of feeding and b) incorporate contents that clarify the contradictions of agrifood system.

Such a finding asks for openness to interdisciplinarity of the technicians, meaning interpenetration and not only a sum of different disciplines. This aspect of training, very much emphasized during the interviews, is also related to the technician’s professional posture towards the community: they should promote dialogue and be open to the “others’
world”, to redeem and value their culture, merits and conditions of life. Speaking of method, one should try and get over the mechanist, Cartesian vision in which the professional is seen as the owner of knowledge that stipulates what is “right and wrong”. This search requires meditation over food and feeding and the favoring of a relationship between equals, teacher and student. It requires as well the ability in conjugating the knowledge of science and of common sense, linking them together in a shared knowledge building that favors community empowerment (Besen, 2007).

Still speaking of methodology, the interviews suggest that this training should have the following characteristics: to be configured as a process, and not as punctual intervention; to be linked to the reality of each community, to their practical experiences; to promote autonomy and empowerment; finally, to consider the multiple dimensions of FNS, including its personal and symbolic aspects and reaching beyond nutritional education. Interdisciplinarity would be the constitutive element of a new way of thinking food and nutrition.

Speeches of interviewees in one hand criticize the bank-clerk, technicist education, in tune with the concepts of Paulo Freire; on the other hand, they see the opportunities of developing more participative methods. The academic discussion about FNS over the last years was mentioned, and included the following aspects: emphasis on the crescent demand for inclusion of the theme in graduation courses, particularly in nutrition; inclusion of nutrition and feeding themes in public health; recommendation of an interdisciplinary approach to feeding and nutrition during the years of graduation; specific questionings to nutritionists’ professional training and practice logics.

Finally, the understanding that FNS materializes itself in different dimensions, from individual to international, led us to ask interviewees about what meanings FNS had for them. The highlight was towards the potential for transformation, including their own habits: they were more coherent, knew more and were more diligent in self-care.

Conclusions

With the objective of analyzing the meanings attributed to FNS notions by civil society organizations represented at the NCFNS during the 2003/2007 administration, we set off using as research tools five categories identified during the reading of the field’s reference documents. The categories were: thematic fields’ rapprochement, human right to adequate and healthy nutrition, strategic objective for development, intersectorial articulation, and educational process.

Civil society has a leading role in pushing forward FNS’ theme into national agenda, and some organizations, particularly those related to the networks and non-governmental sectors do operate with a more holistic vision of food and nutritional security. However, this research allows us to affirm that a big share of civil organizations has not incorporated an integral view of food and nutritional security. For them, the experience of taking part in the national council is a learning process that will eventually result in the apprehension of feeding issues as a coherent, indivisible whole. The process contributes to the development of the theme’s identity and social legitimacy, including inside their networks.

Differences in the emphasis given to FNS aspects are not random, though. Results’ analysis indicates the existence of links between different approaches and appropriations of FNS notion with the nature, action field and type of organization.

Even if, in a first moment, the organization’s vocation determines the theme’s appropriation - such as the notion of nutrition as a right for the unionist segment, or health and consumption for the nutrition professionals, or nutritional aid for the religious institutions – our results indicate that many changes were introduced by the systemic approach. New interactions were made possible, which can modify the nature of actions inside the organizations, in favor of new practices and the revision of the existing ones.

From the point of view of learning, this process helps to overcome the dualistic paradigm and to build integrated knowledge matrices. These have
to consider complexity and interdisciplinarity as constitutive elements of a new form of thinking the relationship between society and nature. In the case studied in this research, our interviewees affirm that their vision about different aspects of the food circuit was widened. Beyond reuniting juxtaposed information (multidisciplinarity), they were able to produce new knowledge about their own reality and started dimensioning it in a different way (interdisciplinarity). By overcoming a sectorized world vision, interdisciplinarity puts human processes into its central position through a better understanding of reality and its complexity.

Methodology to deal with this question has to consider the many points of view of this theme through democratic forms of action. Its interfaces must be dealt with in interactive, dialogical processes leading to a collective development of concepts and exchange of experiences.

Regarding the point of view of human rights, many examples were highlighted of empowerment, of legitimacy strategies and tools in the level of organizations and of public policies. The partnership for intersectorial articulation shows that FNS notions must be deepened if compromises amongst social partners are to be agreed and respected.

These results show that continued education programs should be based in guidelines that are able to reunite the wide network of social actors, organizations and issues that are the very basis of FNS. Other researches should strive to establish a minimum content repertoire for FNS educational programs. Their main point should be the interconnection of all the different dimensions engaged by this theme.

References


